

# Kanpur Historiographers

An internationally Peer reviewed Journal

Biannual Journal of  
New Archaeological & Genological Society

---

*Chief Editor*

---

**Prof. Purushottam Singh**

Maharaj Balwant Singh PG College Varanasi India

*Managing Editor*

---

**Prof. Atul Kumar Shukla**

Pt. Jwahaar Lal.Nehru PG College Banda India

*Associate Editors & Referees*

---

**Prof. Akhtar Hussain Sandhu**

University of Education Lahore Pakistan

**Dr. J. Shunmugaraja**

Madurai Kamraj University Madurai India

**Dr. Rafida Nawaz,**

Bahauddin Zakariya University Multan Pakistan

**Dr. Umakanta Mishra,**

Gandhara Mehar University Sambalpur India

**Dr. Ajmal Mueen M A**

M.A.M.O. College Mukkam, India

**Prof. Farzand Masih**

Foreman Christian College Lahore Pakistan

**Dr. Enayatullah Khan**

Aliah University Kolkata India

**Dr. Mumtaz Alam**

Fiji National University Fiji islands

**Dr. Fatimatuzzahra Rahman,**

Primeasia University Banani Dhaka Bangladesh

**Dr. Zoheb Hasan** Pune India

**Review & Advisory Board**

---

**Prof. Rajendra Singh,** B.U.Jhansi India

**Prof. Raj Kumar Bhatiya,** B.U.Jhansi India

**Prof. U.P. Arora ,** J.N.U.New Delhi India

**Prof. Aroop Chakravarti,** University of Lucknow India

**Dr. Poulami A. Mukherjee,** M.G. University Kerala India

**Prof. R. Mahalakshmi,** J.N.U. New Delhi India

**Dr. Pranjol Protim Kakoti,** D.k.D. College Golaghat India

**Prof. Adesh Gupta,** Dayanand Anglo Vedic College Kanpur India

**Publisher : Secretary N.A.A.G.S. Kanpur Chapter India**

ISSN 2348-3814

# Kanpur Historiographers

Volume X, Issue I, June 2023

DOI: 10.13140/RG.2.2.26778.82880

**An internationally Peer Reviewed and Refereed Journal of History,  
Indology, Archaeology, Epigraphy, Numismatics, Modernity &  
allied disciplines**

**NEW ARCHAEOLOGICAL & GENOLOGICAL SOCIETY**

125/L/89, FF104, GOVIND NAGAR, KANPUR U.P. INDIA ZIP 208006

[www.kanpurhistorians.org](http://www.kanpurhistorians.org)

[dadajhansi@gmail.com](mailto:dadajhansi@gmail.com)

+91 941-555-7103

© Secretary, N.A.A.G.S. Kanpur India

Opinions expressed by the authors in the journal are not those of N.A.A.G.S.

Contributors may mail the soft copy of articles and essays to  
dadajhansi@gmail.com  
Purushottamsingh\_kn02@csjmu.ac.in

Contributors may send the two hard copies of newly published books for publication of Review in the Journal to

**Managing Editor**

New Archaeological & Genological Society  
125/L/89, FF 104, Govind Nagar  
Kanpur U.P. India -208006

**Subscription**

For Individuals : U.S. Dollars 50  
For Institutions : U.S. Dollars 100  
HDFC Bank Govind Nagar Kanpur India  
Account No.- 50200002911251  
IFSC – HDFC0000298

## Editorial

There are many claimants to the past – cultural memory, historical memory and history as a knowledge discipline. Cultural memory is given a long antiquity and traditions are used many times to justify hoary past of cultural identity of particular groups and their relations with the other groups. However as Eric Hobsbawm and Terrence Ranger have shown in the book, *Invention of Traditions*, some of these cultural traditions are actually of recent origins. Moreover, there are many cultural memories which are not only of recent origins but actually are products of various historical constructions, which can be called as historical memory. Prachi Deshpande's work on the making of Maratha identity titled as *Creative Past...* is a good oeuvre on the way history-writing, especially the *Bakhar* genre of historical writing was used to create Maratha Identity politics in the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

This tension between tradition and historical memory on the one hand and current trends in historical practices on the other has thrown many challenges to professional historians. One of the outcomes of these tensions is the question mark over the utilities of history as a knowledge discipline. Accusation from some quarters that all histories that have been written since colonial times are distortion of 'our' true 'national past' finds resonance in many quarters. Colonial historiography and social science approach of history inspired to an extent by Marxist methods are declared harshly as conjoint twins. This is despite of the fact that many scholars acknowledge that recent scholarly contributions of social science influenced historical writings on early India, such as *Past Before Us*, *Historical Tradition in Early India* have rescued Indian historical consciousness from the clutches of Colonial historiography which had periodized Indian history to ancient, medieval India on communal line, accepted only linear time and external historical consciousness. Many of the writings of last 50 years have contradicted claims of the nationalist history writings written during the national movement or in the post Independence period. One drawback of the Marxist historiography is the primary value it attaches to a set of social relations in the production process disregarding other factors that may have shaped up past, such as role concepts like dharma, punya, mlecchas, etc. might have played in shaping social and cultural relations. The same to logic can be applied to medieval modern historiography. Aligarh, JNU and DU historians used concepts and historical theories that located and explained social relations from the perspective of production process and power relations emerging and sustaining them than from other vantage points which may have played important roles in forming historical memory regarding relations between subject population and power groups. Given

the fact history writing has largely been intertwined with the projects of nation-states, historians today face many challenges, including that of being called anti national. As Prasenjit Duara writes the 'nation as the locus of history, if for no other reason than that our values, whether as historians or individuals, have been intimately shaped by the nation-state' and hence, a particular kind of national history backed by nation-state, is contrary to critical narratives of the past that emerged in the last 50 years. However, one can discern a certain political ideological bias of the historians which led them to the construction of historical events in a particular way. For example, the Subaltern historiography emerges out of the ideological belief which makes a critique of and calls for the liquidation of nation-state. These critical formulations are against the grain of the nation-state and hence one witnesses an acrimonious tension between critical history and national narratives.

Journals and journal writings operate within the canons of disciplinary practices. Nevertheless, the conceptual categories employed by historians to construct the past make one genre of historical writing different from the other. Obviously many peer reviewed journals adhere to these scholarly norms. Developing a major argument based on rigorous use of available sources forms the bedrock of disciplinary history. Selectively choosing sources disregarding other available sources which are contrary to one argument – selective omission – is contrary to historian's practices. Peer review brings in rigour to the disciplinary practices. Developing historical narratives based on theories and evidence is what makes history writing such a dynamic discipline. Nevertheless, if one evaluates all issues of the past from the perspective of national history and collective self, then the future of journals and pursuit of knowledge will be in danger.

The collection of articles in this issue of the journal brings to light the history of various geographical domains hitherto neglected, such as the privilege accorded to Malguzars in early land settlements in central Indian districts of Betul, Sagar, Jabalpure and how it resulted in a rackrented peasantry and the dominance of Marwari businessman in these districts. The first article deals on the Narmadanchal and state formation in this region in medieval times. The linear evolution of positivist historiography from tribe to state is actually refuted from many examples of state formation in tribal societies in medieval India, including of state formation by the Gonds in the form of Garh Katang in the time Akbar. Many tribals societies reveal social, political and economic differentiation and force us to understand notion of tribe in the past and present. There are seven articles in this summer issue.

**Umakanta Mishra**

Ravensha University, Cuttack India

---

# KANPUR HISTORIOGRAPHERS VOLUME -X, ISSUE- I, JUNE 2023

## Contents

1	Dr. Suresh Kumar	Vanaprastha and Sannyasa ashram in Indian tradition	<b>01</b>
2	V Vanitha Dr. A.Thennarasu	Problems faces by the malayali tribes in Yercaud	<b>07</b>
3	Dr. M. Govindaraju	Philosophy of Bhakthi Bhandara Basavanna to Eradicate Social Evils	<b>11</b>
4	Dr. Anita Singh	Women silenced into submission: a historical perspective	<b>15</b>
5	Alkesh Zaveri	The Neglected Archeological Site of Amjhara and Karhal Mata Temple: The Archeological Wonder of Late Gupta Period	<b>23</b>
6	Raj Gopal Singh Verma	Farzana to Begum Samru: A New Charade	<b>40</b>
7	Dr. Ajmal Mueen M.A.	Islamic Reform and Mappila Women; An Overview	<b>46</b>